



## Decision Maker's Planning Guidelines

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

### Directions:

1. Work independently, or with another student who has the same role as you and review the articles, "Beyond Slogans: Lessons from Uganda's ABC Experience," "The War Against AIDS and Condoms," and "The ABC of AIDS." You may use other sources if necessary as time allows.
2. Complete only Part 1 of this worksheet to prepare for the debate. Create a list of questions you will ask the advocates for when they meet with you. Ask challenging questions based on the research you have completed to make sure each advocate is able to support his or her position. Also make sure your questions are balanced and not biased in any way.
3. After completing the worksheet, get together with the advocate counterparts and one other Decision Maker. Follow the debate format below to conduct your debate.

**Proposed:** *The United States Congress should fund foreign aid programs for HIV/AIDS that support an "abstinence-only" education and counseling approach.*

Part 1 – Questions:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.
- 5.

Part 2 – Reasons given by each advocate during the debate. Take brief notes while the debate is going on.

REASONS FOR

REASONS AGAINST



Part 3 – After the debate, consider these questions in making your decision:

1. Were the advocates' points relevant to the issues?
2. Were the points supported by evidence?
3. What reasons presented by one advocate, if any, went unchallenged by the other advocate?
4. What evidence, if any, was presented by either advocate that seemed to disprove the other side's position?
5. Were unbiased sources used? If not, did the evidence seem credible and accurate?

After carefully considering the reasons and evidence each side presented I have concluded that:

The reasons that most influenced my decision are:

## Debate Format Reference

### Part I

- The Advocate For should begin and present and defend his or her position on the issue. (10 minutes) During this time the Advocate Against should listen, but may not speak. They can write notes if necessary. The Decision Maker(s) may ask questions at any time.
- Then the Advocate Against explains and defends his/her position on the issue. (10 minutes) (Same rules as above.)

### Part II

- In the last 10 minutes, each advocate group may refute the arguments made by the other side one point at a time. The Decision Maker(s) should moderate this so that each advocate group takes turns rebutting the other side's points. The Decision Maker(s) can also ask questions during this time to either advocate.
- Following the debate the Decision Maker(s) completes his or her planning guide. (This can be done as a homework assignment, if necessary.)

### Part III

- Decision Makers announce their decisions about funding abstinence-only foreign aid programs and the rationale for their decisions.
- Teacher should debrief the activity by asking students the following questions:
  - a. Which arguments by either side were the strongest? Which arguments were the weakest? Why?
  - b. Which ones were the best supported with evidence and were most convincing?
  - c. Which values are at the center of the controversy? What values are in conflict?
  - d. How can the groups achieve consensus on this issue? What would such a policy look like?